## BEFORE THE PUBLIC UTILITIES COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA

Application of Southern California Edison Company (U-338-E) for Authorization: (1) to Replace San Onofre Nuclear Generating Station Unit Nos. 2 & 3 (SONGS 2 & 3) Steam Generators; (2) Establish Ratemaking for Cost Recovery; and (3) Address Other Related Steam Generator Replacement Issues.

Application 04-02-026 (Filed February 27, 2004)

## ADMINISTRATIVE LAW JUDGE'S RULING DENYING MOTION FOR CONFIDENTIAL TREATMENT

On January 13, 2005, California Earth Corps (CEC) filed a motion for confidential treatment of portions of the pre-served testimony of Dr. Joram Hopenfeld. As justification, CEC says that the portions of his testimony for which confidential treatment is requested should be protected for national security reasons. No further justification is offered.

The relevant portions of Hopenfeld's testimony describe specific plant components, their vulnerability to attack, and the consequences of such an attack. CEC's motion does not indicate that the information is not already publicly available, and the testimony of Gordon Thompson filed on behalf of CEC indicates that engineering plans, photographs and technical analyses of every civilian nuclear facility in the United States have been publicly available for decades. While I have no wish to make such information available to terrorists, the information is already publicly available. In addition, I would

187749 - 1 -

A.04-02-026 JPO/sid

think that the record of this proceeding would not likely be the place a terrorist would go for such information.

Therefore, **IT IS RULED** that the motion of California Earth Corps, filed on January 13, 2005, for confidential treatment of portions of the preserved testimony of Dr. Joram Hopenfeld is denied.

Dated January 20, 2005, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ JEFFREY P. O'DONNELL
Jeffrey P. O'Donnell
Administrative Law Judge

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that I have by mail this day served a true copy of the original attached Administrative Law Judge's Ruling Denying Motion for Confidential Treatment on all parties of record in this proceeding or their attorneys of record. Dated January 20, 2005, at San Francisco, California.

/s/ FANNIE SID
Fannie Sid

## NOTICE

Parties should notify the Process Office, Public Utilities Commission, 505 Van Ness Avenue, Room 2000, San Francisco, CA 94102, of any change of address to insure that they continue to receive documents. You must indicate the proceeding number on the service list on which your name appears.